















UNLOCKING HUMAN CAPITAL POTENTIAL IN KUWAIT AS GLOBAL ACTOR IN THE KNOWLEDGE ECONOMY

UNITED NATIONS IN KUWAIT

This policy brief is solely for the use of Kuwait's government officials. No part of it may be circulated, quoted, or reproduced for distribution outside the government of Kuwait without prior written approval from the United Nations Resident Coordinator Office in Kuwait (UNRCO Kuwait). Under the overall direction and guidance of Dr. Tarek Elsheikh, Representative of UN Secretary General and Resident Coordinator to State of Kuwait and Laila Baker, Director of UN Development Coordination Office - Regional Office for Arab States (UNDCO ROAS), Dr. Seung Jin Baek led a core team, which included, Batoul Dawi, Alaa Shuaeb, and Hazel McArthur, UNRCO Kuwait with coordination support of Chakib Zouaghi, UNDCO-ROAS. The team would like to greatly acknowledge the substantive contributions made by Tatjana Colin and Kimberly Parekh, UN Children's Fund (UNICEF), Danilo Padilla and Cedric Neri, UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), Sophia Kagan, International Labour Organization (ILO), Mayada Serageldin, International Organization for Migration (IOM), Fatima Keaik, UN Development Programme (UNDP) and Sameh El Saharty, Health, Nutrition and Population Global Practice of the World Bank.

2 weeks	4 weel	ks		
Stage 1	Stage 2		Stage 3	
Task-force team	Policy discussion and visioning	g exercise	Validation and finalization	<u>on</u>
 Consultation with UN Country Teams in Kuwait (both resident and non- 	-	 Consultation, agreement on the content and the steps, survey instruments, including data and information collection, and analysis 		ious ask- cy brief
resident UN agencies) on issues related to the steps, context, scope and	 Revision of the concept note with a proposed table of contents and contributing agencies by sector Discussion and agreement on the table of contents, contributing agencies and timeline 		 Confirmation of the policy directions and 	
purpose of the policy brief			recommendations	
 Request of coordination support from UNDCO- ROAS 	 Contributing agencies and time Contribution from the task-force early childhood education, healt information and technology, gov 	e team, areas that include th, migration, labour market,	Consultation with the Government of Kuwait	
]		
k-off Workshop nber 2020 18 November 202	Workshop 20 30 November 2020	Workshop 8 December 2020	Workshop 12 January 2021	Delive 20 Januar

In the new knowledge economy, wealth is based on the knowledge acquired and its use, not on material factors of production, given the fact that nearly two-thirds of global wealth is currently generated from human capital accumulation. However, the contributing share of human capital to wealth in Kuwait is estimated at merely 24%. In this context, Kuwait needs to significantly increase its efforts to accelerate the process of human capital accumulation, while also unlocking its human capital potential towards the knowledge economy.

What is the current status of human capital accumulation in Kuwait?

Early childhood development

- Pre-primary enrollment rate remains low (60%) compared to high-income countries' average (83%) despite increased government expenditure on early years' education.
- Nearly 30% of Kuwaiti children aged 6-18 years are considered obese and are thus susceptible to diabetes and other metabolic complications that exert a
 toll on their quality of life, including social, capital development.
- Healthy human capital
 - Non-Communicable Diseases (NCDs) currently cause nearly 80% of total deaths in Kuwait. Therefore, over \$1,000 per person is tied up in direct expenditure on NCDs.
 - More than 1 in 6 adults die prematurely from major NDCs, meaning that Kuwait is currently losing 17% of its productive labour force due to premature death.

Quality and relevance of education and training

- A child is expected to stay 12 out of 14 years in school, but only learns the equivalent of 7.4 years, meaning that children lose nearly 4 years of schooling due to poor learning outcomes. In other words, a high-school graduate in Kuwait learns the equivalent of a middle-school graduate in Singapore.
- Partly as consequence, none of Kuwait's Universities are placed in the "500 World University Ranking." Besides, the national capacity for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) is considered weak, as it is presently ranked at 98th out of 138 countries in the world.

Productive labour market

- One-fourth of the human capital accumulated is not currently being utilised in the labour market, mainly due to a low economic participation by females, resulting in a broadly persistent gender gap, currently ranked at 122nd out of 153 countries (in the Gender Gap Index).
- The labour market segmentation has led to higher unemployment rates among Kuwaitis (6.4%) compared to migrants (1.7%).
- Nearly 58% of unemployed Kuwaitis said they would refuse to work in the private sector (distorted preference of Kuwaitis to work in the public sector), and a limited willingness among Kuwaiti graduates to adapt their skills to labour market needs is observed.

Innovation network interface

- Kuwait has not significantly benefitted from its high level of access to ICT infrastructure, mainly due to ineffective ICT regulatory governance.
- Kuwait is far behind other countries for promoting R&D spending and as a result, performance record in patent applications remains the worst among GCC countries. This suggests that Kuwait is suffering from the "No investment (R&D) No Return (Patent)" principle.
- Kuwait would have greater development potential in utilising Artificial Intelligence (AI) for various IT-driven business dimensions, including the petroleum industry, but it is not yet ready to integrate it into its IT governance system.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY (3 OF 3)

In order to tackle these challenges and obstacles associated with the process of human capital accumulation timely and effectively, the United Nations in Kuwait has conducted rigorous analysis to suggest an integrated strategic positioning with our policy support proposal: Investing in public health, nutrition, education (youth and women) and vocational training is estimated to yield greater rates of return, accelerated by investment in creating innovation environment through partnership as labour force is transformed to be productive and creative for knowledge economy initiative moving forwards.



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary				
I. Objective	6			
II. Current Status	8			
III. Strategic Positioning	22			
IV. UN Policy Support	26			
Reference	37			
Appendix				

WHY HUMAN CAPITAL?

Kuwait's underperformance in terms of the Human Capital Index, compared to nations with similar incomes, is associated with weak "*human capital generating capacity for wealth*"





Source: Lange, Wodon and Carey (2018)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary			
I. Objective	6		
II. Current Status	8		
III. Strategic Positioning	22		
IV. UN Policy Support	26		
Reference	37		
Appendix			

I EARLY CHILDHOOD – LEARNING AND NUTRITION (CHILDHOOD OBESITY)

Human capital creation starts at early age, noting that early education and balanced nutrition are critical for brain development and for building human capital

	PR	E-PRIM	ARY ENRO	DLLMENT	RATE —	
(0% I	20%	40%	60%	80%	100%
Kuwait	60%					
Bahrain	52%					
Oman	56%					
Qatar	61%					
KSA ¹⁾	21%					
UAE ²⁾	78%					
HICs ³⁾	83%					
1) Saudi Ar	rabia 2) Unite	ed Arab Emirate	es 3) High-income	countries		
Pre-primary enrollment rate in Kuwait remains low (60%) compared to other high-income countries (83%) despite increased government expenditure ¹⁾						

1) Kuwait has a high education expenditure per pupil (three times greater than that of Australia per pupil) Source: UNESCO Education database Early Childhood Brain, Cognitive and Socio-emotional Capacities

• Nearly 30% of Kuwaiti children aged 6-18 years are considered obese and thus susceptible to diabetes and other metabolic complications that exert a toll on their quality of life, including social, capital development



- Obesity mostly starts from childhood and the negative effects of childhood obesity on education are most pronounced in adolescence (intergenerational transfers)
- *Kuwaiti women (58.6%) of childbearing age suffer from obesity²⁾*



I EARLY CHILDHOOD – CHILDCARE AND MATERNAL HEALTH

The challenges associated with intellectual and biological maternal human capital have not been properly addressed in Kuwait



Intellectual / biological maternal human capital *"Intellectual maternal human capital encompasses schooling attainment but more importantly maternal acquired cognitive skills such as reading comprehension and non-verbal skills"*

In Kuwait, the risk of anaemia increases 2.8 – 3.5 fold based on the duration of breastfeeding and type of weaning food, respectively, both of which are maternal behaviors that reflect levels of prenatal education

"Biological maternal human capital in the form of longterm nutritional status associated with child outcomes is overlooked in national development planning"

In Kuwait, anaemia is more common in preschool children of anaemic mothers and there is no national level initiative to tackle anaemia in women of reproductive age

2 HEALTHY LIVING – AGAINST DISEASE

The human capital accumulation process in Kuwait has been interrupted by the effects of suffering from Non-Communicable Diseases (NCDs) in recent decades



Source: Global Burden of Diseases study 2019 (NCDs deaths as percentage of all deaths) and WHO Global Health Observatory Data (Premature death from the four target NCDs)

3 EDUCATION AND TRAINING – LEARNING GAP

A child is expected to stay 12 out 14 years in school but only learns the equivalent of 7.4 years, meaning that children lose nearly 4 years of schooling due to poor learning outcomes



3 EDUCATION AND TRAINING – LEARNING POVERTY AND QUALITY OF TEACHING

Ministry of Education officials claim the preparation and continuous development of teachers is a leading cause of Kuwait's poor educational outcome (incl. learning poverty and its gender issue)

LEARNING POVERTY AND KUWAIT MINISTRY OF EDUCATION SURVEY

- <u>Lack of educational focus on building foundational skills</u>: More than half (51%) of children in Kuwait are not proficient in reading by age 10
- <u>Boys' underperformance in school</u>: 58% of boys are unable to read proficiently at age 10 compared to 44% of girls



3 EDUCATION AND TRAINING – QUALITY OF HIGHER EDUCATION

None of Kuwait's universities are placed in "500 World University Ranking," meaning existing knowledge has been likely been added to the economy from studying conducted in other countries

UNIVERSITY	COUNTRY	OVERALL S	CORE						RANK
			ACADEMIC REPUTATION	EMPLOYER REPUTATION	FACULTY STUDENT	INTERNATIONAL FACULTY	INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS	CITATIONS PER FACULTY	
King Abdulaziz University	KSA ⁵⁾	51.7	36.3	52.4	69	99	57	50.2	143
جامعــة خليفــة Khalifa University	UAE ⁶⁾	41.2	11.9	10.2	86.4	100	48.1	52.6	211
	Qatar	37.9	19.3	23.3	69.7	100	95.4	19.4	245
Sultan Qaboos University	Oman	29.1	13.2	13.1	73	100	3.8	12.6	375
ASU a_b_l_b_l_l_rep_L=Bl d_e_ol_p APPLIED SCIENCE UNIVERSITY	Bahrain	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	651-700
Kuwait University	Kuwait	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	801-1000

5) Saudi Arabia 6) United Arab Emirates

Source: QS World University Rankings 2021

3 EDUCATION AND TRAINING – QUALITY OF TECHNICAL TRAINING

The national capacity for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) remains more challenged than that of any other educational competencies of pre- through higher-education



Source: Global Knowledge Index 2020, UNDP Knowledge Project, available from https://www.knowledge4all.com

Especially regarding youth, TVET system in Kuwait does not combine entrepreneurial education to diversify the career pathway to graduates. Besides, the share of youth NEET (Not in Education, Employment and Training) in Kuwait was 24% in 2018 according to ILO (2008). Some 37% of the population is under the age of 14, while 35% is between the ages of 15 and 34, making the provision of high-quality education and training facilities an essential part of national strategies for economic development and diversification.

4 LABOUR MARKET – UNDERUTILISATION AND GENDER GAP

One-fourth of the human capital accumulated is not currently being utilised in the labour market, mainly due to a low economic participation by females, resulting in a broadly persistent gender gap



(2020) Women, Business and the Law Index

7) Kuwait is ranked almost at the bottom of the Women, Business and the Law (WBL) that is based on analysis of laws and regulations affecting women's economic inclusion

184 out of 190

4 LABOUR MARKET – STRUCTURAL PROBLEM

The labour market is equated with various structural issues, including skill-mismatch, public sector preference, market segmentation, lack of incentives, all broadly associated with *Kuwaitization*



4 LABOUR MARKET – PUBLIC SPENDING VS. PRODUCTIVITY

Empirical evidence indicates that government spending (% GDP) is negatively associated with productivity growth due to the pressure on unproductive expenses (e.g. government wage bill, debt)



5 INNOVATION NETWORK – NETWORK READINESS

Kuwait has not significantly benefitted from its high level of access to ICT infrastructure, mainly due to ineffective ICT regulatory governance and its developmental impact



Source: International Telecommunication Union ICT statistics





5 INNOVATION NETWORK – RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT

It appears that Kuwait is suffering from the "No investment (R&D) No Return (Patent)" principle



- Although government spending on the education sector has accelerated in recent years, Kuwait is far behind for promoting R&D spending in terms of R&D expenditure as percentage of GDP compared to the world average.
- As a result, performance record in patent applications per 1,000 population for the past five years remains, on average, the worst among GCC countries.
- Public spending on R&D is critical in stimulating R&D activities in private sector through the form of subsidy, public-private research collaboration, etc.

5 INNOVATION NETWORK – ICT GOVERNANCE

Kuwait would have greater development potential in utilising Artificial Intelligence (AI) for various ITdriven business dimensions, but it is not yet ready to integrate it into its ICT governance system





The petroleum industry in Kuwait could strongly benefit from AI, as its implementation would reduce costs and therefore increase profits. This would be a starting point in Kuwait where AI is not yet a concept that is widely implemented, or even considered as a useful mechanism, as the petroleum industry is by far the greatest source of income for both citizens and the government

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary				
I. Objective	6			
II. Current Status	8			
III. Strategic Positioning	22			
IV. UN Policy Support	26			
Reference	37			
Appendix				

Although these five human capital development areas have negatively been impacted by COVID-19 crisis, they could create greater development potential in the post-COVID-19 era

DEVELOPMENT AREAS	CHALLENGES	COVID-19 IMPACT	OPPORTUNITIES	
1 Early childhood	 Low rate in pre-primary enrollment 30% of Kuwaiti children are considered obese 	Dropout and learning decline due to school closures and lost income	 Increasing the political will for early childhood development in building productive human capital for the future (gender-neutral) 	
2 Healthy living	 NDCs caused nearly 80% of total deaths More than 1 in 6 adults die prematurely from major NDCs 	 Possible malnutrition (or unbalanced) COVID-19 direct impact on health Mental illness indirectly impacted by COVID-19 related interventions 	 Greater emphasis (awareness) on public health Quality human capital accumulation 	
3 Quality & relevance of education / training	 4 years of schooling lost due to poor learning outcomes; quality of (higher) education remains questionable Weak capacity for TEVT 	 Learning decline due to school closures Lack of effective connections between schools and students 	 Use the development of blended learning modalities to introduce more effective teaching and learning materials and approaches, and to provide clear and helpful guidance for teachers to scaffold their lesson preparation and delivery Greater policy harmonisation, e.g., TVET and skill policies with other socio-economic policies 	
4 Labour market	 Low utilisation of human capital (gender gap) Preference for the public sector, skill- mismatch, little incentive for higher productivity jobs, etc. 	 Unemployment and drop in revenue/income/wages (SMEs) Productivity decreased due to work-from-home, morbidity, stress, and isolation While the private sector has to adjust to COVID-19 Impacts, public sector workers have been receiving their paychecks 	 Labour market reforms, repositioning of the labour force (greater inclusion of women and persons with disabilities) Improving productivity with the use of high-technology 	
5 Innovation network	 Ineffective ICT regulatory governance and its developmental impact Low R&D investment, thus low patent application 	 R&D budget constraint due to increased importance for public health Less policy focused on better ICT regulatory governance 	 Unlocking development potential from ICT and AI technological innovation Improving ICT adaptation (computers skills, awareness of R&D investment) 	

The theory of change is formulated by establishing linkages from the five development areas to the development aspiration, "human capital for knowledge economy (HC4KE)"



PRIORITIZING "HC4KE" POLICIES

Seven policy directions that can be prioritised through mapping analysis with 51 policies of the Kuwait National Development Plans 2020-2025 and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)



TABLE OF CONTENTS

E	Executive Summary			
I	. C	Dbjective	6	
I	I. C	Current Status	8	
I	II. S	trategic Positioning	22	
I	V. U	IN Policy Support	26	
Reference				
/	Appendix			

Contribution to National Vision	"Policies that foster nutritional security, physical wellbeing and early brain stimulation for all children yield high returns in their adolescent and later life (as a predictor of future earnings). Health within a high-income country can be promoted through an enabled citizenry, supportive environmental policies and strong regulatory oversight"				
	Desired Change	Good governance is placed in line with a guiding National Strategy against NCD targeting maternal, child and youth health through a whole of society approach, and piloting (e.g., health cities initiative) of contextualised evidence-based interventions is based on integrated programming (nutrition, physical activity, health-promoting schools).			
Policy Direction	Policy Support	 Support and endorse the scaling up of ongoing community-based interventions, that is, to build community capacity while preserving their working models – very good examples are Birth Kuwait and Birth Academy, which have succeeded in building capacity and education in the area of breastfeeding, pre and postnatal care and as such are impactful promoters of health through their unique population-specific insights, rapport and accredited team expertise. Capacity building support for effective adaptation of wider use of telemedicine with integration of mainstream apps for health coaching and advice to ensure timely access of credible advice to all. Empower nurses, social work and allied health students to uptake this role as part of their training. Awareness raising support for implementing behavioral nudges in open communal spaces, schools and workplaces to encourage uptake of healthy habits (e.g., physical activity nudges). 			
	Benefits and Incentives	Better engagement with community and society in the area of public health and its interventions means greater solidarity that enables the country to timely respond to the public health related challenges with less socio-economic cost while maximising the process of accumulating human capital for the knowledge economy agenda.			

Contribution to National Vision	capital with early	"Kuwait's investment into the health and wellbeing of its youngest constituents is critical. Health is a central component of human capital with early childhood being a critical window for brain development and consequently, the development of cognitive, motor, and socio-emotional capacities"				
	Desired Change	If children and their parents are equipped with more information about the benefits of diet and nutrition, exercise, etc. then children and their parents will make better decisions in these areas and therefore mitigate childhood and later adult obesity.				
Policy Direction	Policy Support	 Support school-based interventions targeting children, youth and their parents. This can address the obesogenic environment through regulation of school meals and integration of nutrition-literacy in curricula – collaboration with ministries of education, health (PAFN) and the private sector. Create community and parent-support interventions. Awareness campaigns on childhood obesity within the community and specific guidance to parents on how they can make better choices in terms of diet, nutrition, exercise, etc. 				
	Benefits and Incentives	Improved child health and reduced childhood obesity and adult obesity rates, ultimately contributing to building healthy and productive human capital for knowledge economy.				

Contribution to National Vision	"Kuwait scales up its effort to improve intellectual and biological maternal human capital through a lifelong wellness approach for women, ultimately breaking intergenerational transmission of chronic diseases"				
	Desired Change	A shift from episodic interventions in the gestation period to continuous attention to women's health as part of the national health promotion strategy. A salient example would be folic acid supplementation and smoking cessation, which benefit women's wellness on top of their well-known benefits on birth outcomes.			
Policy Direction	Policy Support	 KNDP policy 7.7 (to promote health literacy and improve people's ability to make appropriate health decisions) improved by mobilising mass media campaigns targeting women of reproductive potential – it entails the design of gender sensitive multisectoral interventions within the national health strategy that extend health information in workplaces and recreational centres. KNDP policy 7.5 (to revamp the healthcare service delivery system and adopt new health technology) improved by mainstreaming scalable, working, local models (i.e., Birth Kuwait and Birth Academy) in building capacity and education in the area of breastfeeding, pre and postnatal care through the use of ICT technologies (i.e., Zoom, WhatsApp). KNDP policy 7.3 (to facilitate the launching of a national health and nutrition survey) improved by further collection of data on use of iron supplements and specific surveys as part of a national anaemia control programme. 			
	Benefits and Incentives	Interruption of the intergenerational transfer of chronic disease and improvement of women's wellness across the lifespan.			

2-1 REDIRECTING EDUCATION AND TRAINING – QUALITY OF INSTRUCTION

Contribution to National Vision		Kuwait's Vision 2035 fully commits to providing every individual with the opportunity for attaining the highest education possible, while its Human Development Plan 2020-2025 commits to "Equip the people with the skills and incentives for future growth"				
	Desired Change	If relevant policies are developed through a series of initiatives including lifelong learning and skills formation, quality assurance and qualification framework, STEM promoted, and strong partnerships with the private sector established, then there will be a skilled and efficient labour force.				
Policy Direction	Policy Support	 Develop teacher management and standards framework to promote inclusive, equitable and gender-sensitive teacher focusing on recruitment, training, deployment, remuneration, career development and working conditions. Reorient university faculties of education to improve teacher preparation and development. University education faculties can take a leading role in improving the preparation of new teachers, with ample practical training, and in the professional development of practicing teachers, to improve on the quality of teaching and learning. The pre-service and in-service programmes should be harmonised and support mechanisms put in place to improve the quality of instruction and learning in schools. Put in place mechanisms for school management and governance. Strengthen district and school leadership in other areas of monitoring and supervision including exploring current practice such as teacher coaching, real-time feedback mechanism loops through social media platforms, etc. 				
	Benefits and Incentives	Improved quality of instruction, starting with a focus on important foundational skills in the early grades, through empowerment, adequate recruitment, motivation and ample professional/career development support.				

2-2 REDIRECTING EDUCATION AND TRAINING – TECHNICAL TRAINNING

Contribution to National Vision	"Kuwait's development aspiration to the provision of high-skilled labour and the development of conducive working environments should be maximised with educated young people with opportunities for professional integration"		
Policy Direction	Desired Change	Youth unemployment addressed by providing them with skills that are useful for labour intensive or even technology intensive quality assurance and qualification frameworks including industries and the knowledge economy.	
	Policy Support	 Develop and implement curricula in education and training addressing employable skills in the labour market. Engage social partners in designing and delivering education and training programmes with career counselling and job placement services that are evidence-based and holistic. Ensure that TVET curricula and training programmes are of high quality and include both work-related skills and transferable skills, including entrepreneurial and basic ICT skills. Put in place an efficient TVET quality assurance and qualification framework. Also, develop a qualification framework for TVET. Ensure transparent, efficient TVET quality assurance systems and qualifications frameworks. Promote TVET skills exchange and transfer among the member states (regionally and globally). Promote collaboration on enhancing transparency and cross-border recognition of TVET qualifications to raise the quality of TVET programmes and enable workers' and learners' mobility, and to ensure TVET programmes keep pace with changing labour and market demands, with particular focus on creating more opportunities for women to join TVET. 	
	Benefits and Incentives	Unemployment addressed by providing with skills that are useful for labour intensive or even technology intensive industries and the knowledge economy; increased synergy of TVET system focus with other important players e.g., UNESCO, European Commission, OECD, etc., and global standards and alignment of practice with global framework.	

Contribution to National Vision	"Kuwait's goal of developing a prosperous and diversified economy, and decent work in the private sector, could be met through a dynamic labour market of nationals and foreign workers, which tackles labour market segmentation through internal labour market mobility"		
Policy Direction	Desired Change	Changes to the sponsorship system to remove restrictions on foreign workers to change jobs are needed by a new Ministerial Decree ^{12),} enabling foreign workers to change employers by giving written notice. Special provisions could be made for workers during their probation period (including having the second employer contribute to the costs of recruitment). This system can ensure a best fit for employers and workers, and furthermore, through increased wages, employers will be encouraged to invest in more decent, productive jobs.	
	Policy Support	 <u>Reform of the sponsorship system</u>, combined with efforts to tackle the absconding regime, can be implemented through Ministerial Orders that remove current restrictions on foreign workers' ability to change sponsors, including between government and private sector contractors, between sectors, and without the permission of the first sponsor. <u>Develop sustainable mobility schemes such as skills mobility partnerships (SMPs)</u> as an innovative tool centred around workers' skills formation and development, while placing special emphasis on multi-stakeholder collaboration. With effective implementation, SMPs can help countries of destination meet skill shortages and labour market needs, improve workers' skills financing instruments for market responsive human capital development with special emphasis on future of work and lifelong learning focusing especially on the target group of NEET, women and persons with disabilities. <u>Strengthen skills certification system</u> to design and deliver innovative, flexible and inclusive learning options, encompassing work-based learning and quality apprenticeships. This should also be added with digital transitions of skills development systems and develop digital skills. 	
	Benefits and Incentives	Better internal labour market mobility would mean greater flexibility to companies (which is important in the context of COVID-19), strategic job matching (easier to find the right worker with the appropriate skills and experience), and improved job satisfaction and motivation, which leads to a greater retention rate (ILO 2017). SMPs encourage labour market integration and career development, which are key factors in improving productivity, social cohesion, and sustainability. Improved productivity and retention of foreign workers result in better economic outcomes and performance of enterprises.	

Contribution to National Vision	"Kuwait's goal of developing a prosperous and diversified economy, and decent work in the private sector, could be met through a dynamic labour market of nationals and foreign workers, which tackles labour market segmentation through internal labour market mobility, social dialogue, improved working conditions and the creation of more productive jobs, combined with targeted training programmes that match skills/job demand.		
Policy Direction	Desired Change	Policies on improving human capital are developed through social dialogue and aligned with development priorities associated with skills and training. Skills development and labour market policies should ideally be part of a comprehensive national employment policy that addresses both the supply and demand sides of the labour market.	
	Policy Support	 Support the involvement of social partners, particularly employers, into the development of training and education programmes that could help address the issue of skills mismatch and would enable educational institutions to review their programmes and curricula in line with private sector needs. Such involvement would help increase credibility of education systems in the country and can also equip the youth and women with the right skills needed by employers. Improve technical capacity for the Kuwait Labour Market Information System (KLMIS)¹³ collection for labour market analysis in the light of future of work and skills mismatch to design and implement active labour market policies (ALMPs) – employment services, including career guidance, job search assistance and counselling, can raise awareness about emerging sectors and job opportunities, thereby contributing to better skills matching and opportunities (for nationals and foreign workers), as can closer engagement of employers in the private sector with training providers. Awareness raising support and guidance to both private and public sector for encouraging female labour participation, including dare care facilities at places of employment, empowering role models, changing attitudes and among others. Actively engaged females in labour market and better educated females would raise healthier and smarter children who will likely be better equipped with market needs. 	
	Benefits and Incentives	Fewer disputes and better worker-employer relationships; improved competitiveness due to creation of a level playing field for companies, more efficient and less costly recruitment and worker deployment; decreased recruitment and repatriation costs as workers can be locally hired with fewer intermediaries; better law enforcement, more attractive environment for foreign investment and enhanced international reputation. Success of Kuwaitization programmes by preparing nationals to take up jobs that are currently performed by foreign workers. This will be supported by SMP collaborations that will promote the acquisition of skills necessary to fulfill labour market gaps and needs. In case of foreign workers, it will promote regulated labour migration, including in the framework of bilateral and multilateral labour arrangements and agreements, based on skills demand and relevant, quality training provisions for potential and return foreign workers, and further regulate potentially flagged or problematic migration corridors.	

13) It was launched in 2015 as a critical tool and source of data to analyse the impact of policy change, for instance the impact of COVID-19 on labour markets and the administration of human capital.

4-1 DESIGNING INNOVATION ENVIRONMENT – ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE GOVERNANCE

Contribution to National Vision	"Development of Artificial Intelligence (AI) technology is part of the wider ecosystem of Internet and other advanced ICTs including big data, Internet of Things, blockchains, etc. that could create a business environment where knowledge is created, acquired, transmitted and utilised effectively by enterprises, organisations, communities and individuals in an innovative fashion"		
Policy Direction	Desired Change	If AI governance with regards to international standards is established, Kuwait will be positioned to accelerate the process of an ICT-driven knowledge economy while also promoting human rights, transparency, accountability and redressing of violations and abuses.	
	Policy Support	 Support the design of AI governance using UNESCO's Internet Universality indicators to measure Human Rights, Openness, Accessibility and Multi-stakeholder participation and to thereby map and improve the ecosystem in which AI is developed, applied and governed. Capacity building support for the development of AI enabling environment; strengthen research infrastructure for AI; support open access dissemination of research; boost coding skills through trainings; strengthen policies for Media and Information Literacy; and support access to AI specific computational hardware through subsidies. Assess algorithmic discrimination in order to protect the right to equality of all, in particular of historically marginalised populations. Facilitate development of norms and policies for improving openness and transparency in AI algorithms through elements of ex-ante information disclosure and ex-poste monitoring of algorithmic decision-making. Assess AI potential for inclusive and quality digital transformation in higher education system 	
	Benefits and Incentives	More active participation in AI governance from all stakeholder groups, including but not limited to the government, private sector, technical community, civil society, academia, among others.	

4-2 DESIGNING INNOVATION ENVIRONMENT – PUBLIC-PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP

Contribution to National Vision	"As part of striving to improve the business environment, institutional policymaking capacity to engage both the private sector and Kuwaiti citizens into the country's transformation process is imperative – focusing on the public-private partnership (PPP) with emphasis on environmentally sustainable development aspiration"		
Policy Direction	Desired Change	Depending on the partnership nature, the government plans to draw private sector investments for projects (for green and/or education initiative) and/or waste management in the form of either BTO, BTL or other procurement schemes ¹⁴⁾ while benefitting innovative ideas from private sector and reducing fiscal burden in the context of dual shock (i.e., COVID-19 and oil price drop).	
	Policy Support	 Policymaking capacity support to Kuwait's Supreme Council for Privatization and Kuwait Authority for PPPs in designing the most effective procurement schemes by bridging innovative and green technologies from the private sector. The support areas include feasibility study in collaboration with both public and private entities, reform of institutional architecture and regulatory framework¹⁵ (supported by strong political will) for sectors such as: Municipal solid waste management – i.e., regularising waste picker initiatives as part of PPP arrangement; involving private sector in disposal projects such as sanitary landfill technology, recycling and among others Green infrastructure and its management – e.g., green building, solar panels and eco-friendly insulators at old schools, wastewater treatment, among others Greening PPPs with strengthened policymaking capacity are closely associated with six NDP policies, including 2.2. Increase private sector participation; 4.4. Expand the role of the private sector; 6.1. Improve water resource management; 6.2. Build eco-cities; 6.4. Boost the role of renewables; 6.5. Integrate solid waste management Design and implementation support for privatization of public school system with the use of PPPs procurement scheme 	
	Benefits and Incentives	It should be understood not just as a mechanism to ease the fiscal pressure and help public financing but more importantly as a way of introducing private sector technology and innovation in providing better public services under the principle of sharing ownership and responsibility in an inclusive and sustainable fashion.	

14) BTL refers to low risk, low return investment whereas BTO is a high risk, high return investment. See Appendix A – types of PPPs arrangement (procurement schemes)

15) See Appendix B – Guidance on unified institutional framework of PPP for further discussion

ANALYTICAL FLOW ON ECONOMIC BENEFIT FROM IMPLEMENTING NINE HC4KEs

Investing in public health, nutrition, education (youth and women) and vocational training is estimated to yield greater rates of return, accelerated by investment in creating innovation environment



16) Erwin, Mays and Riley, 2011; 17) IFPRI, 2016; 18) Maazouz, 2013; 19) Psacharopoulos and Patrinos, 2018; 20) Almeida and Carneiro, 2006

21) Baek, 2018 and Damodaran, 2021; 22) support programme may include minimum revenue guarantee, redemption of excess revenue, risk-sharing structure

WAY FORWARD

Proposed UN policy support will be translated and mainstreamed into key areas of UNCT integrated programme through a series of policy consultation and implementation of NDPs and SDGs



"To transform Kuwait into a financial and trade hub, attractive to investors, where the private sector leads the economy, creating competition and promoting production efficiency, under the umbrella of enabling government institutions, which accentuates values, safeguards social identity, and achieves human resource development as well as balanced development, providing adequate infrastructure, advanced legislation and inspiring business environment"



UN policy support, effectively mainstreamed into 8 priority areas and 51 corresponding policies of <u>Kuwait National Development Plan</u> <u>2020-2025</u>, mirrored in the <u>UN Kuwait Strategic Cooperation</u> <u>Framework</u> and 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, through a series of policy consultation with policy owners, high-level policy dialogue, conferences as well as technical assistance for implementation of the policies

REFERENCE

- Alhouti, I. 2018. Teacher Professional Development in Kuwait and Singapore: Learning from others. World Voices Nexus, Vol 2, No 3. Available at: <u>https://www.worldcces.org/article-2-by-alhouti/teacher-professional-development-in-kuwait-and-singapore-learning-form-others</u>.
- Almeida, R. and Carneiro, P., 2006. The return to firm investments in human capital. *Labour Economics*, Vol 16, Issue 1, pp 97-106.
- Baek, S.J., 2018. The political economy of neo-modernisation: Rethinking the dynamics of technology, development and inequality. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Barrot, D., K. Hamilton, Q. Wodon, A. Yedan, B. Fraumeni, and G. Liu. forthcoming. Measuring Human Capital Wealth. Education Global Practice. Washington, DC: World Bank
- Central Statistical Bureau, 2016. Labour Force Survey 2015. [online] The Government of Kuwait. Available at: <u>https://www.csb.gov.kw/Pages/Statistics_en?ID=64&ParentCatID=1</u>.
- Damodaran, A. 2021. Return on Equity by Sector [latest update: 5 January 2021]. Available at: http://www.stern.nyu.edu/~adamodar/pc/datasets/roe.xls.
- Databank.worldbank.org. 2020. Human Capital Index | Databank. [online] Available at: https://databank.worldbank.org/source/human-capital-index.
- Databank.worldbank.org. 2020. World Development Indicators | Databank. [online] Available at: <u>https://databank.worldbank.org/source/world-development-indicators</u>.
- Erwin, P.C., Mays, G.P. and Riley, W.J., 2011. Resources that may matter: the impact of local health department expenditures on health status. *Public Health Reports*. Vol 127, No 1, pp. 89-95.
- GlobalData. 2020. ICT Spending In Kuwait Will Reach US\$10.1Bn By 2024 Globaldata. [online] Available at: https://www.globaldata.com/ict-spending-in-kuwait-will-reach-us10-1bn-by-2024/.
- Groof, Z., Garashi, G., Husain, H., Owayed, S., AlBader, S., Mouhsen, H., Mohammad, A. and Ziyab, A., 2019. Prevalence, Risk Factors, and Fetomaternal Outcomes of Gestational Diabetes Mellitus in Kuwait: A Cross-Sectional Study. *Journal of Diabetes Research*, 2019.

- International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI), 2016. Global Nutrition Report 2016: From Promise to Impact: Ending Malnutrition by 2030. Washington, DC: IFPRI.
- International Labour Organization (ILO). 2011. Kuwait Ministerial Order No. 200 (A) Of 2011 Concerning The Regulation Of Employment In The Private Sector. [online] Available at: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/natlex/natlex4.detail?p_isn=89816&p_lang=en.
- International Labour Organization (ILO), 2017. Employer-Migrant Worker Relationships In The Middle East. Beirut: ILO.
- International Labour Organization (ILO). 2018. ILOSTAT. [online] Available at: https://ilostat.ilo.org.
- International Telecommunication Union (ITU). 2020. *Statistics*. [online] Available at: <u>https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-D/Statistics/Pages/stat/default.aspx</u>.
- Knowledge4all.com. 2020. *Global Knowledge Index 2020 | Kuwait | Country Profile*. [online] Available at: <u>https://www.knowledge4all.com/ScoreCard2020.aspx?id=21&language=en</u>.
- Lange, G., Wodon, Q. and Carey, K., 2018. The Changing Wealth Of Nations 2018: Building A Sustainable Future. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Maazouz, M., 2013. Return to investment in human capital and policy of labour market: Empirical analysis of developing countries, *Procedia Economics and Finance*, Vol 5, pp. 524-531.
- Portulans Institute, 2020. Network Readiness Index Report 2020. Network Readiness Index. [online] Available at: https://networkreadinessindex.org/.
- Psacharopoulos, G. and Patrinos, H.A., 2018. Returns to Investment in Education: A Decennial Review of the Global Literature. *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper* 8402. Available at: <u>https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/29672/WPS8402.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y</u>.
- Public Authority for Civil Information (PACI). 2021. Statistics Services Systems. [Online] Available at: https://www.paci.gov.kw/stat.
- QS Quacquarelli Symonds, 2020. QS World University Rankings 2021 Report. QS World University Rankings. [online] Available at: <u>https://www.qs.com/portfolio-items/qs-world-university-rankings-2021/</u>.
- Salman, A., Al-Hemoud, A., Fakhraldeen, S.A., Al-Nashmi, M., Alfadhli, S.M. and Chun, S. 2020. Research and Development as a Moderating Variable for Sustainable Economic Performance: The Asian, European, and Kuwaiti Models. Sustainability. Vol 12, Issue 18. Available at: doi.org/10.3390/su12187525.

- The Lancet, 2020. *The Global Burden Of Disease Study 2019*. Global Burden of Disease. [online] Available at: https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/issue/vol396no10258/PIIS0140-6736(20)X0042-0#.
- UNESCO. 2020. UNESCO Databases Of Resources On Education. [online] Available at: <u>https://en.unesco.org/themes/education/databases</u>.
- United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia (ESCWA). 2020. Survey of Economic and Social Developments in the Arab Region 2019-2020. Beirut: ESCWA.
- World Bank. 2019. EduAnalytics: Kuwait Learning Poverty Brief. [online] Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at: http://pubdocs.worldbank.org/en/470081571223580152/MNA-MNC05-KWT-LPBRIEF.pdf.
- World Bank. 2020. Human Capital Project. [online] Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at: https://www.worldbank.org/en/publication/human-capital.
- World Bank. 2020. The Human Capital Index 2020 Update: Human Capital In The Time Of COVID-19. [online] Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at: https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/34432.
- World Bank. 2020. World Development Indicator. [online] Available at: <u>https://databank.worldbank.org/source/world-development-indicators</u>.
- World Economic Forum, 2020. *Global Gender Gap Report 2020*. Geneva: World Economic Forum.
- World Health Organization. 2020. Global Health Observatory (GHO) Data. [online] Available at: <u>http://awareness.who.int/gho/en/</u>.
- YouGov. 2016. New Bayt.Com And Yougov Survey Sheds Light On The Skills Gap Crisis In The Middle East. [online] Available at: https://mena.yougov.com/en/news/2016/05/09/new-baytcom-and-yougov-survey-sheds-light-skills-g/.

APPENDIX A – TYPES OF PPP ARRANGEMENTS (PROCUREMENT SCHEMES)



- Ownership of the infrastructure facilities is transferred to the government upon completion of construction, and the concessionaire is granted the right to operate them and gain a return on investment.
- Ownership of the infrastructure facilities is transferred to the government upon completion of construction, and the concessionaire is granted the right to operate them and receive government payments.

Build–Transfer–Lease (BTL)

Receives government payment based on operational performance



• The concessionaire owns and operates the infrastructure facilities upon completion of construction. Ownership is transferred to the government upon termination of the concession period.

APPENDIX B – GUIDANCE ON UNIFIED INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK OF PPP



17) This stands for conventional procurement

UNLOCKING HUMAN CAPITAL POTENTIAL IN KUWAIT AS GLOBAL ACTOR IN THE KNOWLEDGE ECONOMY

@uninkuwait
 @uninkuwait
 www.kuwait.un.org

f unitednationsinkuwait

•• www.flickr.com/people/uninkuwait/

www.youtube.com/channel/UCXX0vKZAJRj7yWxJr3q309g